



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY

---



UNEP

## IPCC Working Group II Fourth Assessment

### Sign-off letters from Review Editors

---

**Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

**IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK**

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## TECHNICAL SUMMARY

---

**From:** Wolfgang Cramer (PIK) [mailto:Wolfgang.Cramer@pik-potsdam.de]

**Sent:** 28 February 2007 21:55

**To:** Van Der Linden, Paul

**Cc:** Jean Palutikof; Daniel Murdiyarso

**Subject:** IPCC WG2 TS

Dear Paul,

I really feel sorry to have missed the deadline, and I am aware that you now must have, as you announced, decided to consider that I, too, have "signed off" the Technical Summary of WG2. I apologise, but - like many others - I was simply overwhelmed by the mass of review comments. I realise that my co-editor, Daniel Murdiyarso, has already supplied his "signoff" to you.

I now just want to let you know that I have now done sufficient checking in order to - admittedly after the deadline - confirm that:

- to my best knowledge, the review process for the development of the Technical Summary in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the Principles Governing IPCC Work, has been properly followed,
- my reading of the Final Government Draft of the Technical Summary confirms the satisfactory completion of this process,
- my reading of the Final Government Draft of the Technical Summary confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

I apologise again for the delay of this message and I thank the IPCC for the honour to be invited to work in this function for a very important document.

Best wishes,

Wolfgang

---

---

**Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

**IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK**

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Section: **Technical Summary**

Name: **Daniel Murdiyarso**

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES/NO (Yes)

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES/NO (Yes)

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES/NO (Yes)

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 7 February 2007

---

---

Co-Chairs: **Oswaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 1

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 1

Name: Lucka Kajfez Bogataj

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Lucka Kajfez Bogataj

Date: 26 Jan. 07

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: Chapter 1

Name: Andrew Watkinson

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*): A.R. Watkinson

Date: 22 January 2006

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## Comments from Andrew Watkinson on the responses of the contributing authors to the SOD comments for

### Chapter 1

The authors of Chapter 1 have responded positively to the various comments on the SOD. In particular, the cross-referencing with WG1 to ensure consistency has been addressed and considerable efforts have gone into clarifying the section of the chapter on joint attribution, which attracted number of comments from referees.

In general I am happy that the comments have been addressed but there are a number of points listed below that should be clarified before this document becomes public.

p59-69 References to NA, A and TR. It is not clear what these mean. I presume that A is addressed and TR is text rewritten. Is NA not accepted and if not, why were the comments not accepted. These comments need to be filled out before this document becomes public.

E-1-412/414 These indicate queries and not that the comments have been dealt with.

E-1-442, 446, 460 It states here that references can be added under the editor's discretion. Who is the editor? The CLASs? We need to know whether the references have been added.

E-1-457 It is not clear how the statement has been addressed in the text.

E-1-466 and others. It states here that checks should be made with the original authors. We need to know in all such cases whether checks have been made with the original authors.

E-1-483 Lake Baikal is not in Europe (Table 1.6). It is in Asia.

E-1-603 Were these references followed up?

P103-104. There are several places here where it says that references have not been added because of space and do not introduce new facts. Perhaps this is the case but I would like to know whether any of these references make the point better and whether any of them would help improve the regional balance.

E-1-639 It is not clear whether this has been addressed

E-1-706/7 and in several other places on 0117/118. There are several statements indicating 'will do'. We need to know that these have been actioned.

E-1-708 Has this been discussed with CLA and has action been taken.

E-1-756 The action taken is unclear.

Andrew Watkinson  
22 January 2006

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

January 29, 2007

## Chapter One

### Responses by Authors to Comments by Review Editor

Comments from Andrew Watkinson on the responses of the contributing authors to the SOD comments for Chapter 1

The authors of Chapter 1 have responded positively to the various comments on the SOD. In particular, the cross-referencing with WG1 to ensure consistency has been addressed and considerable efforts have gone into clarifying the section of the chapter on joint attribution, which attracted number of comments from referees.

In general I am happy that the comments have been addressed but there are a number of points listed below that should be clarified before this document becomes public.

p59-69 References to NA, A and TR. It is not clear what these mean. I presume that A is addressed and TR is text rewritten. Is NA not accepted and if not, why were the comments not accepted. These comments need to be filled out before this document becomes public.

#### *Chapter One Answer:*

*The following abbreviations were often used by Chunzhen Lui in the hydrology section.*

*A: Addressed*

*NA: Not applicable*

*TR: Text removed*

*NA did not mean Not Accepted but No Applicable.*

E-1-412/414 These indicate queries and not that the comments have been dealt with.

*E-1-412: The authors looked for published papers on observed coastal changes in the Netherlands, but did find any. The impacts there are very confounded by other driving forces.*

*E-414 Authors looked for published citation with this information but couldn't find one. The reviewer needs to supply a published paper for consideration.*

E-1-442, 446, 460 It states here that references can be added under the editor's discretion. Who is the editor? The CLASs? We need to know whether the references have been added.

*E-1-442: Martin Edwards, our Marine Biological Systems CA, felt that this satellite study was over a too short time-period to provide evidence of climate change but left the final decision up to the CLA, who sided with Martin Edwards, and the reference wasn't added.*

*E-1-446: Again, Martin Edwards felt this change was unnecessary, but left the final decision up the CLA, who agreed with the more specific "off the coast southern Californian coast."*

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

*E-1-460: The CLA agreed with Martin Edward and saw no need to include this older reference.*

E-1-457 It is not clear how the statement has been addressed in the text.

*The statement suggested by the reviewer (but rejected by Martin Edwards) was not brought forward the SPM.*

E-1-466 and others. It states here that checks should be made with the original authors. We need to know in all such cases whether checks have been made with the original authors.

*The author was contacted and he gave permission for the figure to be used. The legend has been rewritten, in accordance with the paper the figure was taken from.*

E-1-483 Lake Baikal is not in Europe (Table 1.6). It is in Asia.

*We will change text of Table 1.3 to give the location of Lake Baikal as Russia and we will add the Shimaraev and Domysheva 2004 reference when we receive the Final Government Reviews.*

E-1-603 Were these references followed up?

*We looked for these references, but the reviewer did not supply enough information for us to find these exact references. However, we do have more recent material from authors with the same names, who we believe may be the same authors.*

P103-104. There are several places here where it says that references have not been added because of space and do not introduce new facts. Perhaps this is the case but I would like to know whether any of these references make the point better and whether any of them would help improve the regional balance.

*Both the Amazon and Canada are covered in our chapter, so including these references is not necessary for improved regional balance.*

E-1-639 It is not clear whether this has been addressed

*Text of entire section, including Summary was rewritten.*

E-1-706/7 and in several other places on 0117/118. There are several statements indicating 'will do'. We need to know that these have been actioned.

*The Contributing Author did what he said he would do. "Will" deleted from comments.*

E-1-708 Has this been discussed with CLA and has action been taken.

*Addressed earlier.*

E-1-756 The action taken is unclear.

---

**Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

**IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK**

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>





WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY

---



UNEP

*Energy and tourism selected because they are key socio-economic issues; a section on regional adaptation has been added in the FGD as well. The suggested references were checked, but neither of them is directly related to the topic of Section 1.3.9, and therefore were not included. The first one is about a survey of 600 Alberta households on knowledge, attitudes and behaviours related to climate change. The Second one is about the development of a socio-cognitive Model of Private Proactive Adaptation to Climate Change (MPPACC) and its application to two case studies.*

Andrew Watkinson  
22 January 2006

---

**Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

**IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK**

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 2

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR



**Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research**  
Integrated Systems Analysis

Hans-Martin Füssel · PIK · Postfach 60 12 03 · D-14412 Potsdam

DR. HANS-MARTIN FÜSSEL

IPCC Working Group II  
- Chair -  
Meteorological Office  
Fitzroy Road  
Exeter EX1 3PB  
United Kingdom

Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research  
Telegrafenberg  
P.O. Box 60 12 03  
14412 Potsdam  
GERMANY

Phone: +49 - (0) 331 - 288 - 2537  
Fax: +49 - (0) 331 - 288 - 2600

E-mail: [fuessel@pik-potsdam.de](mailto:fuessel@pik-potsdam.de)  
WWW: [www.pik-potsdam.de](http://www.pik-potsdam.de)

December 19, 2006

#### Letter concerning the review process for the IPCC AR4 WG II Chapter 2

Dear Chairman,

I am writing to you in my capacity as a review editor for Chapter 2 of the Working Group II contribution to the IPCC Fourth Assessment Report.

This letter confirms:

- That the review process for the development of Chapter 2 in the AR4 WGII assessment, as laid out in the IPCC procedures, has been followed properly. YES
- That my reading of the FGD Chapter 2 confirms the satisfactory completion of this process. YES
- That the chapter properly reflects scientific controversies. YES

I have no other comments on this chapter.

Best regards,

(Dr. Hans-Martin Füssel)

**Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

**IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK**

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 2

Name: Geoff Love

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 28 February 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 2

Name: Roger B. Street

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Original Signed by Roger B. Street

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 26 January 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 3

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

#### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

##### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR (Letter requesting signoff)

Chapter number: 3. (please insert number)

Name: Alfred Becker (please insert name)

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed:

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process:

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies:

YES

##### *Further explanation (agreed with James P. Bruce):*

The authors of Chapter 3 have carefully considered and as appropriate, reflected in the text all government and expert comments on the draft chapter, and have annotated their responses. In particular we appreciate the repeated revisions of many texts in the drafts.

A small number of comments were considered but rejected as inappropriate, or not consistent with the current understanding. As Review Editors, we concur in the judgments of the Authors in these cases.

However, we wish to draw the attention of the Bureau to issues that may arise and comments that might result in controversy at a later date or at the final plenary sessions:

##### GOVERNMENT COMMENTS:

- a) G-3-26: Introduction – U.S.A. objects to including idea that “water is now recommended to be a human right” (never formally accepted). However, references now included should help.
- b) G-3-182: U.S.A. considers that Millennium Development Goals is a “political concept” and so not relevant to the assessment.

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

## WORKING GROUP II

### IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

22/01/2007 20:34 +49-331-2882642

PIK - EVA

S. 03



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

## WORKING GROUP II

### IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

#### EXPERT COMMENTS:

- a) E3-143: The text does not deal with declining death toll from floods. (Golkany, U.S. Dept. of Interior) WMO claims the above is due to better forecasts and warnings and Trenberth (E3-577) suggests this should be a more prominent adaptation.
- b) E3-240: Lack of reference to recent greening of parts of Sahel. (Golkany, U.S. Dept. of Interior).
- c) Several prominent experts, Trenberth (E- 161, 188, 377, 378) Bergstrom (382) Gerten (Potsdam) (386), Raga (384) think that too strong an emphasis is placed on CO<sub>2</sub> direct influences on runoff without enough of the counter-arguments published and unpublished especially in last paragraph of 3.4.1
- d) A number of comments from ISDR mostly about disaster loss reduction measures for adaptation not accepted. E-607, 617, 633, 639, 669.

#### BOTH GOVERNMENT AND EXPERT COMMENTS

- a) 3.57 Late Argentina and 3-388 Canziani – there is no reference to chapter 13 in the groundwater section 3.4.2.
- b) 3-120 U.S.A. and 3-402 Mote – the issue of increased groundwater recharge in SW USA and its implications are questioned. (Comparing Fig. 3.4 and 3.5, it appears that more recharge is projected where annual runoff declines?)
- c) E3- 2, 80, 81, 250, 272, 292, 293 and Ireland G3-11: Trenberth asks for greater attention to increased potential evapotranspiration. (Section 3.3.1 still implies precipitation is most important in all basins but for large lake basins, it is evaporation that is critical, making climate models more useful in those basins.)

#### Signature:

A. Becker and J. P. Bruce

Date: 22. January 2007

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

01/25/07 03:41 FAX 6137313509

01



WMO

## INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 3 (please insert number)

Name: James P. Bruce (please insert name)

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES/NO Yes

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES/NO Yes

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES/NO Yes

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Please see additional comments provided by  
Co-RE. Alfred Becker.

Signature (paper copies only):

Date: 22/01/07

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)  
IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK  
Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 4

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

**From:** Wolfgang Cramer (PIK) [Wolfgang.Cramer@pik-potsdam.de]

**Sent:** 27 January 2007 21:47

**To:** Van Der Linden, Paul

**Cc:** Sandra Diaz; Jean Palutikof

**Subject:** [SUSPECTED SPAM] Re: IPCC Review Editors

**Attachments:** Wolfgang.Cramer.vcf

Dear Paul,

actually Sandra just reminded me that she had already in December sent you the following statement (which must have been lost somewhere, but I repeat and confirm it here):

\* That the review process for the development of Chapter 4 in the AR4 WGII assessment, as laid out in the IPCC procedures, has been followed properly. YES

\* That our reading of the FGD Chapter 4 confirms the satisfactory completion of this process. YES

\* That the chapter properly reflects scientific controversies. YES

\* We would welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended below: (please write these here) NO COMMENTS AT THIS STAGE. THE AUTHORS AND THE TSU ARE CONGRATULATED FOR THIS ENORMOUS ACHIEVEMENT.

Best wishes, also on behalf of Sandra Diaz,

Wolfgang Cramer

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>





WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

**From:** Sandra Díaz [mailto:sdiaz@com.uncor.edu]

**Sent:** 28 December 2006 19:29

**To:** Van Der Linden, Paul

**Subject:** RE: IPCC chapters and comments available on Review Editors' website

Dear Paul

Thank you very much for your response. Here are my answers to your questions.

\* That the review process for the development of Chapter 4 in the AR4 WGII assessment, as laid out in the IPCC procedures, has been followed properly. YES

\* That my reading of the FGD Chapter 4 confirms the satisfactory completion of this process. YES

\* That the chapter properly reflects scientific controversies. YES

\* We would welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended below: (please write these here) **NO COMMENTS AT THIS STAGE. THE AUTHORS AND THE TSU ARE CONGRATULATED FOR THIS ENORMOUS ACHIEVEMENT.**

With my very best wishes for 2007

Sandra Díaz

---

**Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

**IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK**

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 5

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 5

Name: Lucka Kajfez Bogataj

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Lucka Kajfez Bogataj

Date: 26 Jan. 07

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 5

Name: John Sweeney

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES/

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 24<sup>th</sup> January 2007

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)  
IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK  
Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)  
IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK  
Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 6

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 6 *(please insert number)*

Name: Job Dronkers *(please insert name)*

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 17-01-2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## COMMENTS ON THE CHAPTER 6 FINAL GOVERNMENT DRAFT (FGD)

BY REVIEW-EDITOR J. DRONKERS

### Previous Chapter 6 drafts

The first draft of Chapter 6 was heavily commented by external expert reviewers. The writing team has spent great efforts to digest and implement these comments. The result was a greatly improved second order draft.

### Expert comments on the second order draft

The expert comments were much less severe and much less in number than for the first order draft. Apparently many experts considered that their comments on the first order draft had been implemented in a satisfactory way. Most of the comments were suggestions for further improvement and additions, often on minor points. Only few expert comments had a controversial character.

### Government comments in the second order draft

The executive summary was criticised, both for the wording and for the content. Several reviewers deemed insufficient the underpinning of some statements and the consistency with the text. Other points of criticism raised by several reviewers pertained to the lack of regional specificity and to insufficient cross-referencing among chapters.

### Implementation of the comments

Some major comments were discussed by email before the Cape Town meeting; remaining important comments were discussed during this meeting. Most time was spent on improving the executive summary.

### The Final Government Draft

The executive summary has been completely rewritten in response to the reviewers' comments. The summary has not only been reformulated, to bring out more clearly the major policy relevant findings, but it has also been rendered fully consistent with evidence from the literature discussed in the body text. Many sections have been further improved thanks to the review comments and references to other chapters have been added. The global scope of the chapter precludes dealing with all specific regional and local climate impacts on coastal zones; however, examples referring to specific local settings are cited throughout the report. For this, a considerable amount of literature has been processed. To my opinion the final government draft is a well-balanced chapter reflecting the present state of knowledge agreed by a broad community of coastal experts in the world.

### Concerns

- Review comments were received from only a fairly limited number of countries, in spite of the serious impacts of climate change on coastal zones
- I have not checked whether statements on coastal impacts in other chapters are consistent with chapter 6

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 6

Name: Geoff Love

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 28 February 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 06

*(please insert number)*

Name: ONG Jin Eong

*(please insert name)*

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 29 Feb.,2007.

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 7

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 07

Name: David Satterthwaite

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

David Satterthwaite

Date: 26<sup>th</sup> January, 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>





WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 7 (please insert number)

Name: Y.A.D.S.Wanasinghe (please insert name)

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

I have read the Chapter carefully and I am very satisfied with the final draft. I apologise for the delay in sending the statement.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 28.01.2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 8

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

**TSU Note: This is the statement by Review Editor Susana I. Curto, National Academy of Medicine, Argentina.**



WMO

INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

CHAPTER 8: ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

#### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 8  
Name: Susana Isabel Curto

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature

Date: January 25<sup>th</sup>, 2007.

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc\\_wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc_wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>

**Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

**IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK**

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 8 *(please insert number)*

Name: Health *(please insert name)*

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Comment: The author team has done a satisfactory job in responding to rather a lot of late comments. Some might have benefited from a little more time for discussion, but I am not aware of any serious omissions or mis-responses.

Anthony J McMichael  
Review Editor, Chapter 8, Volume II

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: Jan 26 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 9

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: #9

Name: Fredrick Semazzi

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: February/01/2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: **9**

Name: **Mohamed SENOUCI**

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

**YES**

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

**YES**

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

**YES**

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 26/01/2007

---

Co-Chairs: **Oswaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695      Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)      Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 10

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 10 *(please insert number)*

Name: Daniel Murdiyarto *(please insert name)*

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES/NO : Yes

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES/NO : Yes

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES/NO : Yes

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature *(paper copies only)*:

Date: 25 January 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 10 *(please insert number)*

Name: Shuzo Nishioka *(please insert name)*

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES/

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Because of the time limit in the last moment, LAs have missed some trivial editorial points experts and RE commented, which are not so fatal to the process.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Shuzo Nishioka

Date: 23/01/2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 11

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR



WMO

## INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

#### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

##### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 11  
 Name: Australia and New Zealand

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature:   
 Michael Coughlan

Date: 28 January 2007

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)  
 IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK  
 Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681





WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: Chapter 11 (Australia and New Zealand)

Name: Assoc. Prof. Henrik Moller

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

**General Comment:** The chapter authors worked effectively and thoroughly through all the critiques offered. There were few substantive concerns raised and those were carefully analysed, cross-checked, and headed where scientific evidence warranted. I am confident that the process was complete and safe in all respects.

*Henrik Moller*

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 5 March 2007.

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 12

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

#### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

##### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 12 *(please insert number)*

Name: Seppo Kellomäki *(please insert name)*

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES/NO Yes

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES/NO Yes

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES/NO Yes

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature *(paper copies only)*:

Seppo Kellomäki

Date: January 24, 2007

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 12

*(please insert number)*

Name: Ivan Nijs

*(please insert name)*

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES/~~NO~~

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES/~~NO~~

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES/~~NO~~

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 17 January 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## Comments from Ivan Nijs

### 1. General

The SOD of CH12 was in my opinion already well underway to reach the standards of IPCC and has further improved since. The quality of the chapter is now very high. The authors have enhanced precision concerning the scenarios used in cited studies, as well as their time horizon, up to the extent that including further detail would go at the cost of readability. Short-term forecasts (2020-2050) are now much better represented. The very recent literature has been included. Linguistic expression of uncertainty now generally follows IPCC guidelines. I am not sure though that the use of “will” in the main text always corresponds with virtual certainty, and I propose to do a final check on this. Some paragraphs still read like lists, but the problem has been greatly reduced, and in some cases this is hard to avoid. The ES now much better reflects the diversity of impacts, but adaptation remains less represented than impacts (main text is ok on this point).

Impact on biodiversity has been expanded to include more groups of organisms. Energy has received a more prominent place as justified by the energy crisis, and health is now also better covered. Positive effects are highlighted a bit more, which will avoid criticism of not being impartial. Text parts that received much criticism have been carefully reviewed (in particular: northward moving of forest into tundra biome, windiness changes, less or more frost damage in spring, biodiversity impacts, THC). Still few cost estimates are given, which may reflect availability. Among the phenomena that still receive little explicit attention are thresholds for impact, although this information is provided indirectly in cases where multiple time slices are specified. The lack of integrated assessments of impacts reflects the paucity of available studies and is mentioned in table 12.6.

### 2. Appraisal of how the comments were addressed

In almost all cases the comments have been carefully considered and appropriate action was taken. I only have the following items left:

#### EXPERT COMMENTS

12.Z4: novelties since and contradictions with TAR are not really addressed other than (very briefly) in the ES, and even here TAR is mentioned only once. There is a section about TAR but it is left up to the reader to distinguish from the wealth of information in CH12 what are the key novelties or contradictions relative to this section on TAR. People don't want to spend time reading what they already know. As a example, colleagues in my department who heard that I was acting as RE, have all asked me the same question: what is new? The chapter would benefit from inserting here and there phrases like “opposite to the TAR” or “confirming the uncertain estimates at the time of TAR”, etc. This can easily be done on say 10 or 20 critical locations, without having to change the existing text.

12.Z9: stabilisation scenarios are mentioned, say the authors, but I could not find the word stabilization anywhere.

12.S.8: section 12.4.8.2 on transport is conspicuous for not giving quantitative data (in contrast with the preceding section on energy); section 12.5.8 still has a very vague paragraph on adaptation of transport.

12.S12: I could not find the current numbers.

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

E-12-301: I do not know if there is much information available on climate warming effects on yield quality, but data on elevated CO<sub>2</sub> effects on yield quality certainly exist. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> research in the USA in fact started with testing all major crops. Yield based on vegetative plant parts should in any case be affected by elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, as the latter generally reduces leaf nitrogen content on a mass basis.

E-12-395: many readers will be highly interested in guidelines on where new reserves (or expansion of old ones) should be located geographically in Europe, to be most efficient. If there is controversy on whether it should be the northern or southern edge, please mention the controversy, in order to stimulate research. The matter is too urgent to wait until the next report.

E-12-454: Does *relative to the 'pre-industrial' climate* mean that compensation by warming itself is not included in the impact of shutdown? If so, I expect that readers will find this strange, because shutdown is a consequence of warming, so it does not seem to make sense to give expectations on the impact of shutdown alone, without the coinciding counteractive effect of its cause (i.e. warming). I guess the reason for presenting it like this, is that the outcome will vary depending on how much the climate has already changed when shutdown occurs. It will probably become clear if you explain the latter to the reader.

E-12-481: (c) and (d) seem valid comments. It says "Table will be changed" but it was not for these items.

## GOVERNMENT COMMENTS

G-12-24 and G-12-116 It should be indicated at the beginning of the impact section that impacts are in the absence of adaptation measures. This is mentioned at the beginning of the ES but it is not clear whether it applies only to the ES or also to the impact section. Otherwise confusion may arise, see for example 17/37, where a decline in grassland area is predicted, vs. 28/2 suggesting to increase grassland area as an adaptation. I derive that this adaptation was not in the prediction on 17/37.

G-12-197: please carefully reconsider the option of irrigating current (!) dryland pastures.

G-12-235: table 12.4 is about impact; why is it in the sustainable development section?

G-12-237 34/10: transparency of criteria is needed, e.g. why are "tree line upward shift" and "northward/inland shift of tree species" in blue? They seem to imply negative effects on mountain/arctic tundra. Idem for northward migration of marine biota: why is this positive? Are the two blue arrows for Marine fisheries correct for North?

### 3. Other comments on content

The most critical ones are underlined.

4/16: not clear how nitrate leaching restrictions are related to the climate story (for other sectors, the background drivers (the D in the DPSIR scheme) are not mentioned either).

6/3: 12.2.1: are there no studies on observed changes in storminess? Since this comes back later in the predictions so it has no counterpart here.

6/44: what exactly is implied by the statement that Russia has greater oil reserves than OECD?

11/23: shouldn't 12.3.2 also contain trends in fossil fuel use?

15/17-19: not clear from this part how climate warming intensifies coastal and marine eutrophication.

15/21: shouldn't 12.4.3 mention CO<sub>2</sub> effects, even if little is known?

17/39: "Grasslands are expected to decrease in area by the end this century": give reason so the reader can understand?

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

18/42: the effect of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on plants is not mentioned at all (does species-specific stimulation generally reduce or increase plant diversity?). I suggest to add this to the research gaps in table 12.6, as it is a major uncertainty in climate envelope modelling.

26/28: contrary to the previous section, 12.5.2 does not give a single concrete adaptation measure, in spite of the first line stating that strategies are well documented.

27/50: shouldn't this specify where in Europe (probably not an option in the south)

28/40: you may want to add that this involves a risk of biological invasion!

29/48-30/1: this is mitigation of climate change, not adaptation to it, so this section does not belong here: reducing emissions by saving energy will mitigate all impacts, not just those on the energy and transport sector. There is confusion here between impact ON the energy sector, and how the energy sector could contribute to mitigating climate change.

32/43: are there no probability estimates for "any slowing in circulation before then"? Since there are for shutdown. Without probability estimates for slowing down, the reader is extensively informed about the consequences of an event of which the likelihood is not given.

33/5-6: "Results suggest that the repercussions for socio-economic factors are likely to be less severe than formerly might have been expected." This suggests that the consequences will not be so bad, while there are some very serious ones listed in Table 12.3 such as "Movement of populations to S. Europe and shift in the centre of economic gravity". I deduce that the earlier expectations were even more extreme, but the former sentence does not state that they were. Please consider rephrasing.

## 4. Details (spelling, wording, etc.)

3/36: please consider using drought stress instead of water stress (the latter could also mean excess water)

3/39: in 4.2.1 it says from 16 to 44 million

4/10: add "other" to human stresses?

7/10: Table 12.1: chapter reference only in last line?

9/25: delete "the"

10/36: not clear what is meant by "although large"

11/10: does "increase" mean in frequency, or in duration?

11/37-40: complicated sentence

12/10: should be Table 12.4 instead of 12.6

12/51: missing "is"

13: two times missing ")" after Lehner 2006

13/32: withdrawal/availability higher than 40%: a ratio in %?

16/2: experience a "loss"

17/38: missing "of"

17/51: should be "De Boeck" (also wrong in refs)

18/25: missing "to"

19/14: should this not be fig. 12.2?

20/7: "and then winter on European coasts in winter" sounds like a tautology

20/25: you probably mean "by 2050", "until 2050" suggests that values will change afterwards

20/33: delete "2020" in "wheat 2020"

21/7: "stocking"

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

- 21/31: “Our ability to assess biodiversity impacts, ecosystem effects and socio-economic costs of climate change in coastal and marine ecosystems is still limited but is likely to be substantial for some highly dependent communities and enterprises”: does this mean we don’t know our ability?
- 21/23-34: does this include CO2 effects or only temperature?
- 21/28-37: this part is vague
- 21/40: is there a missing comma?: ... warmer sea temperatures, increased growing seasons...
- 23/29: sentence is grammatically not correct
- 25/15: I could not find a reference to this figure in the text
- 27/25: repetitive
- 27/39: greater
- 28/48: to occur
- 29/11: delete “the”
- 29/33: developed
- 30/3-6: unclear
- 30/21: “The increasing, new climate-related risks to health, availability of water, energy demand and infrastructure is likely to be dealt with efficient co-operation with local governments.”: unclear
- 30/39: I suspect that “mitigation” should be removed
- 30/40: “remedial measures for damages” are not adaptation (I assume you simply mean “repair”)
- 31/19: space between value and °C or not? It varies
- 31/24: were reached
- 31/37: delete “was a”
- 32/47: “rises in RSL”: so far always SLR was used
- 32/51: “likely to have potential”: double indication of uncertainty, one is enough
- 32/51: should be Table 12.3
- 33/8: Table 12.3: there is overlap in content between the second and third bullet
- 33/20: remove comma
- 33/10: low-lying coastal birds?
- 34/4: should be Table 12.4
- 36/2: its many economies
- 36/8: close brackets at end: )
- 36/18: last table is incorrectly numbered
- 36/18: this table is full of small mistakes (spelling, brackets, etc.), and it does not read very fluently; in fact I found 12.8 the least easy to read section of the entire chapter 12; it would be a pity to end a nice chapter in this way!
- 37: line 4 and 5 are repetitive
- 37/12-13: complicated sentence
- 37/21: full stop missing; the table should come all the way at the end if you refer to it only in the last line.

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 13

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: **13 LATIN AMERICA**

Name: **Max Campos Ortiz**

Post-it <sup>®</sup> Transmisión por Fax 7671		FECHA/ DATE	Nº DE PAGINAS/ # OF PAGES
PARA/TO	DE/FROM		1
OSVALDO CANZIANI	MAX CAMPOS		
COMPANIA/CO.	COMPANIA/CO.		
MARTIN PARRY	CPPH		
DEPARTAMENTO/DEPT.	TELEFONO/PHONE		
	(506) 231 5791		
FAX	FAX		
44 1392-88 5681	(506) 296 0047		

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES/NO **YES**

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES/NO **YES**

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES/NO **YES**

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

**Besides my reading of the Chapter I had a final phone conversation with CLAs in order to discuss some small points which I need to have clear before signing this document, therefore, I feel a complete satisfaction on how the group work the whole process a reach to the final document.**

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: **26 January 2006**

Co-Chairs: **Oswaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, **Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK**

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>

Co-Chairs: **Oswaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, **Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK**

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>





WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

DE : PRESIDENCIA

NO. DE TEL : 54245485

20 MAR. 2007 10:35AM P1



WMO

## INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 13 Latin America

Name: Edmundo de Alba Alcaraz

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES, there was only one and is reflected.

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

An effort was done by the authors to take each one and all comments into consideration, and to incorporate acceptable suggestions.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: March 20, 2007

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter E K1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

+44 (0)1392-885681



WMO

## INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 13

*(please insert number)*

Name: Philip M. Fearnside

*(please insert name)*

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature *(paper copies only)*:

Philip M. Fearnside

Date: 15 January 2007

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 14

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 14 (North America)

Name: Michael MacCracken

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report, which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

I was very impressed with the efforts of the author team on the chapter, having to cover so much in such limited space. The multiple rounds of drafting, review, and redrafting worked well in both ensuring the accuracy and completeness of the chapter and in helping the authors to integrate and synthesize the key issues.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 17 January 2007

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 14 North America

Name: Gordon McBean

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Gordon McBean

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 26 January 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 15

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 15

*(please insert number)*

Name: Roger G, Barry

*(please insert name)*

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 17 January 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 15

*(please insert number)*

Name: Robert L. Jefferies

*(please insert name)*

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: January 18th, 2007.

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

FEB 19 2007 11:33 FR IDRC 10TH FL 613 563 0815 TO 011441392885681 P.02



WMO

## INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 15 (please insert number)

Name: JOHN M R STONE (please insert name)

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES  NO

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES  NO

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES  NO

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (paper copies only):

Date:

19/02/2007

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)  
IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK  
Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)  
IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK  
Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 16

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

---

**From:** gilliancambers@aol.com [mailto:gilliancambers@aol.com]

**Sent:** 08 January 2007 17:29

**To:** Van Der Linden, Paul; Palutikof, Jean

**Cc:** utrotz@yahoo.com

**Subject:** Signing-off on Chapter 16

From: Gillian Cambers, Review Editor, Chapter 16,  
[gilliancambers@aol.com](mailto:gilliancambers@aol.com), [g\\_cambers@hotmail.com](mailto:g_cambers@hotmail.com)

Date: 08.01.07

This confirms:

- That the review process for the development of Chapter 16 in the AR4 WGII assessment, as laid out in the IPCC procedures, has been followed properly.
- That my reading of the FGD Chapter 16 confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.
- That the chapter properly reflects scientific controversies.

I note, for the record alone, and not requiring any further action of the part of the authors:

1. There were three minor omissions in dealing with the reviewers' and governments' comments, as follows:

- E-16-70/73: This paragraph should have been rewritten to clarify the discussion on precipitation from the discussion on temperature
- E-16-87: A reference should have been included for the statement about Caribbean sea level rise being on average 1 mm yr<sup>-1</sup>
- G-16-36: Unfortunately no reference was made to 2005 being a record year for cyclone activity in the Caribbean

2. There was one other comment where I would have advised the authors to pursue a different path to the one they took had more time been available

- E-16-12: I think that the chapter could have benefited from a mention of the likely island impacts of sea level rise resulting from the melting of the Greenland and West Antarctic ice sheets

Yours sincerely,  
Gillian Cambers

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>





WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 16 (please insert number)

Name: Ulric O'D Trotz (please insert name)

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature

Date: 26<sup>th</sup> January 2006

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 17

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

#### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 17 & 18

Name: Allali Abdelkader

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (paper copies only):

Date: Friday, 26 February 2006

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 17 Adaptation

Name: Neil Leary

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

**YES**

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

**YES**

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

**YES**

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

The authors of chapter 17 were thorough in their assessment of relevant literature and gave careful consideration and response to expert and government comments at each stage of the process.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 17 January 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 17

Name: Antonio Rocha Magalhaes

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: January 17, 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 18

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

#### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 17 & 18

Name: Allali Abdelkader

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (paper copies only):

Date: Friday, 26 February 2006

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 18 (please insert number)

Name: Michael Grubb (please insert name)

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES/NO  
Sufficiently

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES/NO  
To an acceptable degree

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

I have caveated my acceptance as indicated because I believe that in parts of the chapter, the balance and coverage of issues remains short of the what would be desirable in the IPCC, though this is as the authors note partly due to inadequacies of the underlying literature. My co-review editor, Uriel Safriel, has indicated a number of specific review comments on which responses were not as complete as would be desirable; I share his observations on this.

I also share Uriel's view that the Chapter has improved greatly since the Second Order Draft and the authors are to be commended for this additional effort.

IN my judgement, parts of the chapter still reflect early problems of a rather slanted approach to literature cited, inadequate cross-referencing and consistency with other chapters (notable 17, 19 and 20: the latter is significantly referenced but not fully "integrated" in the Chapter 18 discussion). In section 18.4 I think there remains a tendency to place too much emphasis upon a limited set of model based results.

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

I have accepted the authors implementation of the Review process because a number of these limitations are lessened and/or more directly indicated and accepted by the authors, and where model results are emphasised (eg. in 18.4), due caveats have also been entered suggesting that the underlying literature is still very patchy and frankly inadequate to the task required. The result, a somewhat slanted starting point (in the view of many reviewers) now duly caveated, is acceptable, though disappointing compared to what might have been possible in terms of a fuller and more balanced and rounded assessment from the outset.

In addition, and importantly, I consider the Executive Summary to be a good and balanced statement of the state of knowledge; it avoids the difficulties associated with quantified model analyses largely by drawing qualitative not quantitative conclusions. Though disappointing, this is perhaps a wise reflection of the state of the literature.

I do flag one outstanding concern, but this largely falls outside the remit of Review Editors and thus does not constitute grounds for objection. The discussion of “damages avoided” in section 18.4.2 really seems to draw upon three quite disparate standpoints with little attempt at synthesis. To only slightly caricature, it cites some studies that suggest serious damages may occur at such low stabilisation levels (eg. 450ppm) as to be more or less unavoidable. In stark contrast appear to be conclusions cited from Tol and Yohe that most dangerous impacts could be avoided even at quite high stabilisation levels, such as 850ppm.

These two poles in turn are strikingly different from the box, which offers a more graduated analysis but is cross-referred to Working Group III, presumably drawing upon some more graduated literature. The net effect is a quite unsettling mix of perspectives, without even a single place in the IPCC where the literature and issues are fully worked out around this crucial question.

It is clearly too late to change this in the AR4 process. I would urge the IPCC to consider whether the Synthesis report could make progress by considering these three perspectives, and the underlying literatures, in a more integrated manner, albeit within its limited space and procedural requirements.

Whether or not this is possible (and I appreciate the constraints), I would urge the IPCC, after the dust on AR4 is settled, to give extensive consideration to the problem of integrating analysis across impacts, adaptation and mitigation, particularly those arising at the global level. Ever since the closing furores in 1995 around the Second Assessment Report Working Group III (which was explicitly mandated to address cross-cutting issues – not mitigation per se), I have argued that this is a fundamental problem given the architecture of the IPCC in the TAR and AR4, and that more considered thought should be given to this challenge. I had not expected the problems to be quite so starkly illustrated by the difficulties this chapter has experienced in striving to reach a fully integrated, rounded and consensual assessment of the state of knowledge.

Signature (*paper copies only*): Michael Grubb

Date: 22 Feb 2007

**Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

**IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK**

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR Uriel Safriel

Chapter number: 18 *(please insert number)*

Name: **Inter-relationships between Adaptation and Mitigation** *(please insert name)*

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES/NO

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES/NO

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES/NO

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

**Authors were confronted with a large number of reviewers' comments, many of which (a) did not recognize this chapter is on A-M linkages, and neither on A nor on M; (b) requested including their perceptions; or (c) asked to make their own publications cited. The authors responded positively to many of the comments, and satisfactorily explained why they had not attend the others. There has been an order of magnitude improvement of the chapter from one draft to the next. My own feeling is that the chapter can be further improved, nevertheless - given that this is the first attempt in the IPCC to tackle this topic, I full-heartedly sign it off.**

Signature *(paper copies only)*:

Date: 2<sup>nd</sup> February, 2007

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>





WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 19

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR



WMO

### INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

#### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 19 (please insert number)

Name: RAMAN SUKUMAR (please insert name)

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES/ NO

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES/ NO

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES/ NO

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (paper copies only):

Date: 22 Jan 2007

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 19  
Name: Jean-Pascal van Ypersele

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date:  
13 February 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

---

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 19

*(please insert number)*

Name: John Zillman

*(please insert name)*

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

**YES/NO** The Lead Authors handled the process very fairly and conscientiously.

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

**YES/NO** but with some caveats as attached.

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

**YES/NO** but with some minor caveats as attached.

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (*paper copies only*):

Date: 25 July 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk) Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

**INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE**

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

**REVIEW EDITOR STATEMENT ON CHAPTER 19 OF  
WORKING GROUP II AR4  
ADDITIONAL COMMENTS AND CAVEATS**

I was present for almost all of the Lead Authors' consideration of Review Comments on Chapter 19 at both the Merida and Cape Town Lead Authors' Meetings and can confirm that, in my observation, the Coordinating Lead Authors and Lead Authors all took the process of response to Review Comments very seriously and did their best, through their point-by-point discussion, to identify fair and appropriate responses to every comment. While some Reviewers had gone to excessive lengths to draw attention to their own views or publications, the Lead Authors treated each comment on its merits and rarely showed (what would have been an entirely understandable) inclination to become dismissive of overly repetitive or overstated comments from particularly aggressive Reviewers.

2 It is important to note, in respect of Chapter 19, that the Chapter's heavy dependence on material from other Chapters (and from Working Group I) made it particularly difficult for the Lead Authors to produce an up-to-date draft for Government and Expert Review and it had to be expected that substantial re-writing would be needed after Cape Town to bring the Chapter into alignment with the rest of the Report, as well as to respond to the detailed Review Comments on the Chapter itself. It is therefore understandable that the 'Final Draft for Government Review' cannot be as comprehensively reconciled with the Review Comments on the previous draft as for some of the other chapters.

3 The above said, there are some specific problems with the Lead Authors' completed responses to review comments (and hence with the Final Draft for Government Review) which require me to record some small caveats to my answer (ie 'Yes') to each of the questions on the Pro Forma 'Statement by Review Editors' in respect of Chapter 19. They are as follows:

- (a) Traceability. I had expected that the Lead Authors' response in the 'Notes of the Writing Team' column would in most, if not all, cases identify where, in the revised text, the issue raised had been responded to. In fact, with a few commendable exceptions (eg 19.Z.15 (p 6), E-19-14 (p 114), G 19-218 (p 45), E 19.1 (p 15)), this is not done and it is extremely difficult to find where, in the revised text, the response is incorporated or implicit. While, as a Review Editor, I am happy to certify that the Lead Authors have responded fairly to the general sense of the majority of comments, I can not, in many cases, provide explicit certification in respect of the specifics.
- (b) Significant points not fully taken on board. In several places (eg E-19-9 (p 18), E-19-91, 92 (p 44)) where the balance of comments suggests an approach different from the Lead Authors' preferred approach and they have chosen to stick with their own preference, responses such as 'Unfortunately we cannot please everyone . . . ' do not really do justice to the points being made and give an arguably misleading justification of the basis on which they have rejected the Reviewer's proposals.
- (c) Misleading implications that comments have been taken on board. There are numerous places (eg G-19-86 (p 21), G-19-107 (p 22), G-19-111 (p 27), G-19-149 (p 34), G-19-166-169 (p 37)) where, by using words like 'yes', 'OK', 'Text Revised', 'Text revised to deal with many of these issues' etc, the Lead Authors imply that they have actually taken the Reviewers' points on board whereas, in fact,

---

**Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

**IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK**

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695  
Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

**INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE**

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

they have either ignored them, deleted any relevant text where they might have been incorporated, or actually taken a different position in their revised text.

- (d) Uncompleted responses. There are several places where, in the 'Notes of the Writing Team' column, the Lead Authors have not gone back and tied off their final response. For example:
- E-19-206 (p 74) 'Will address in text'
  - E-19-227 (p 78) 'Will check'
  - E-19-322 (p 92) 'Will look at'
  - E-19-3 (p 112) 'Review and will consult chapters'
  - G-19-156 (p 35) 'Will consider'
  - G-19-183 (p 39) 'Can consider'
  - G-19-207 (p 43) 'Looking for better reference if there is time'
- (e) Erroneous statements. There are some (but not many) places where it is stated that something will be done, or has been done, and it clearly hasn't, eg G-19-255 (p 53) where it states '19.4.4 will be changed to 19.5' but the change has not been made.

4 I should also draw attention to one particular point on which it is arguable that the Lead Authors have tried to give the impression of having responded to Review Comments but have subtly avoided doing so to the extent implied. In lines 18-19 of the Introduction (p 5 of the Final Draft) they leave ambiguous whether 'other judgements' are 'value judgements' or 'scientific judgements' ('other judgements informed by the state of scientific knowledge'); and then, while asserting (Notes of the Writing Team in response to G-19-22 (p 7)) that 'the key vulnerabilities in this chapter are intended to provide information useful to policy makers in making their DAI judgements, not to provide those judgements', the Lead Authors appear to build in quite a lot of value judgements and equate DAI with 'key vulnerabilities' in the later text (eg p 29, line1, p 30, line 35).

5 In summary, though, I believe the Lead Authors of Chapter 19 are to be commended on the fair and conscientious way they handled the extensive Expert and Government Review Comments on their successive drafts.

(J W ZILLMAN)

Review Editor, WG II, Chapter 19

25 January 2007

---

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695  
 Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
 Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## CHAPTER 20

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 20 *(please insert number)*

Name: Robert W. Kates *(please insert name)*

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES/

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

I want to commend the CLAs and the LAs for their hard work, their response to critiques and their skills in working together!

Signature *(paper copies only)*:

Date: 1-29-07

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)

IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: AR4-20

Name: Professor Mohamed A. SALIH  
Institute of Social Studies  
2502 LT The Hague,  
The Netherlands

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature

The Hague, Date: 12 February 2007

**Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)**

**IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK**

Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695

Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681

Email: [ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk)

Website: <http://www.ipcc-wg2.org>



WMO

# INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

## WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

FEB 19 2007 11:34 FR IDRC 10TH FL 613 563 0815 TO 011441392885681 P.03



WMO

## INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON CLIMATE CHANGE

WORKING GROUP II

IMPACTS, ADAPTATION AND VULNERABILITY



UNEP

### WORKING GROUP II FOURTH ASSESSMENT

#### STATEMENT BY REVIEW EDITOR

Chapter number: 20 (please insert number)

Name: JOHN MR STONE (please insert name)

The review process for the development of the Chapter in the Working Group II Fourth Assessment, as laid out in the *Principles Governing IPCC Work*, has been properly followed.

YES  NO

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms the satisfactory completion of this process.

YES  NO

My reading of the Final Government Draft of the Chapter confirms that it properly reflects scientific controversies.

YES  NO

We welcome any other comments on the report which may be appended, or written below. In particular, if you are unable to answer in the affirmative to any of the statements above, please provide further explanation.

Signature (paper copies only):

Date:

19/02/2007

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)  
IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK  
Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk Website: http://www.ipcc-wg2.org

\*\* TOTAL PAGE .03 \*\*

Co-Chairs: Osvaldo Canziani (Argentina) and Martin Parry (UK)  
IPCC WGII Technical Support Unit, Met Office, Hadley Centre, Fitzroy Road, Exeter EX1 3PB, UK  
Phone: +44 (0)1392 88 6695 Fax: +44 (0)1392 88 5681  
Email: ipcc-wg2@metoffice.gov.uk Website: http://www.ipcc-wg2.org